



*Promoting the use and conservation of historic properties for the education,
inspiration, pleasure and enrichment of the citizens of Sioux Falls*

Regular Meeting Minutes for June 12, 2019

Members Present:

Rob Collins
Alex Halbach
Pam Cole
Jennifer Dumke
Shelly Sjovold
Lura Roti
Lynn Remmers
Thomas Keller 4:20

Members Absent:

Rachael Meyerink

Staff Present:

Diane deKoeper, Neighborhood Planner, BoHP Staff Liaison

Public in Attendance:

Jacque and Jessica McNamara, Property Owner
Jarrod Smart, Jarrod Smart Construction
Kathy Renken, Jarrod Smart Construction
Lloyd and Mona Schrader, McKennan Park HD Property Owner
Aaron Bakker, Property Owner @ 1719 S. 5th Ave.
Nathan Wieber, Property Owner @ 1102 S. Main Ave.

1. Call to Order and Quorum Determination

Vice Chairperson Rob Collins called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions

Vice Chairperson Rob Collins welcomed Board members and guests and gave introductory comments.

3. Approval of Regular Agenda

Vice Chairperson Rob Collins requested a motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Pam Cole made the motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Shelly Sjovold seconded the motion. The motion to approve the regular agenda passed unanimously.

4. Approval of the May 29, 2019, Meeting Minutes

Vice Chairperson Rob Collins requested a motion to approve the May 29, 2019, meeting minutes. Member Pam Cole made the motion to approve the minutes as presented. Member Alex Halbach seconded the motion. The motion to approve the May 29, 2019, meeting minutes passed unanimously.

5. Public Input on Non-Agenda Items (five-minute period)

There was no public input received.

6. New Business

- A. 1710 S. 4th Avenue
McKenna Park Historic District
(Board action required)

Jarrod Smart and Kathy Renken, JSC

The parcel at 1710 S. 4th Ave. is currently vacant.

The board will apply the Secretary of Interior Standards for New Construction for review of this project.

Jarrod introduced the property owner, Jacque McNamara and her daughter Jessica. Jarrod provided a program description as to the space needs and architectural elements the owner requested with the house. Jessica uses a wheelchair; therefore requiring accessibility to all areas on one level in the design of the new home is a priority. Paratransit also provides transportation in this area for Jessica. The property has a sanitary sewer easement running diagonally through the southeast corner of the yard, which creates a challenge to the layout of the house and garage.

Jarrod presented the compliance of the Secretary of Interior Standards (SOIS) in his submission with examples of properties in the neighborhood and detailed explanation for the application. Jarrod provided an addendum since the last meeting of varying architectural elements that exist in new residential construction. The design style of the McNamara home is eclectic. Based on a general review of the standards and examples of other properties in the neighborhood, the proposed house design appears to comply with the SOIS as presented.

Square footage of the proposed house is 3,889 SF. The garage is 1,908 SF. Average size of a home, per occupant is 1,058 (2015 census bureau). This does not take into account a handicap accessible home.

Jarrod provided product samples for construction of the house. Modern materials allow for more durability and less maintenance. Material information as discussed at the May 29, 2019 meeting are:

- GAF Sienna Asphalt Shingles – Roof Shingles
Diamond shape shingle at tower
- Marvin NexGen Windows – 4-Pane Double Hung Clad Windows
- Artisan Series Siding – Lap Siding 4”
- Mira Tec – Columns, trim, etc.
- Metal Corners – in lieu of mitering lap siding corners
- Brick – Classic brick, color has not been selected
- Limestone – Columns caps
- Bead board – underside of barreled entry
- Gutters – half round, aluminum
- Garage Doors – 8’-6” tall due to height of van/suv for accessibility. West facing garage is a singlewide door.

Jarrod reviewed the National Register of Historic Places description of McKenna Park noting that eclectic and substantial houses typify the district. “Eclecticism is the key to this period of construction for the architects often freely combined many different architectural vocabularies, materials and textures to create visually exciting, often playful, and always interesting houses.” Jarrod noted that the proposed design of this home is not religious to any one style.

Member Roti confirmed with Jarrod that the front yard setback of the proposed house aligns with the adjacent home to the north.

Member Collins reviewed the use of the three dormers on the front façade of the home. As Jarrod mentioned at the last meeting, the dormers are “false”. They do not function to bring daylight into the home. Additional highlights from the previous discussion that Rob reviewed were the ramp/sidewalk that does not require handrails. Finials are proposed to cap the turret and gable ends. Member Cole noted that the footprint of the home is large, but because the garage is setback further than the house and at the corner, it appears smaller.

Member Halbach noted his appreciation for materials with brick, higher end double-hung clad windows, finials, the turret, and diamond shaped shingles. Alex also noted that the materials and design of the new home creates a “gateway” property to the neighborhood, and entrance to the park.

Member Sjovold stated she still has trouble with the tower. She feels that the style of it is “too early” for rest of the neighborhood. The use of the tower pre-dates 1910, 1890s specifically and is not something found in McKennan Park. Member Cole noted that Jarrod provided images in the updated packet of modern towers that creates interest to the house with some vintage flair. She cited the SOIS “contemporary design should not directly mimic historic buildings.” Jarrod stated that the tower provides a panoramic view of the park from the homes interior. Member Collins stated that he does not feel the proposed design violates the standards.

Member Remmers stated that there is simplicity of other homes in the neighborhood and this design has more complexity to which may challenge how it fits into the neighborhood. Lynn referenced 1600 S. 4th Ave. that successfully blends various features of the house that are simpler. Member Collins noted that if the dormers were removed, it might simplify the “busyness” of the design. Member Halbach commented that it might simplify the design too much and the dormers are necessary to create balance, and provides the appearance of a story and a half or two-story structure. Member Dumke and Cole agreed that keeping the dormers help to give an appearance of a taller structure.

Member Sjovold questioned the use of the doublewide garage doors and asked if they could be modified to two single doors. Jarrod responded that for the van to park in either garage, the doublewide doors provides better flexibility and function than single doors.

Member Halbach noted that the proposed design contributes to the eclectic look in the district as noted in the National Register. He also reminded board members that based on the description, it took 40-50 years to develop the district and there is a mix of styles that include; craftsman, Mediterranean, and ranch all within a couple blocks. The proposed house design contributes to the eclecticism, flair and dynamics of other homes around the park.

Member Cole made the motion that the new construction of the property at 1710 S. 4th complies with the SOIS of new construction and does not create an adverse effect on the McKennan Park Historic District. Member Halbach seconded the motion. The vote was in favorable with six Yeses and 1 No.

Kathy Renken with Jarrod Smart Construction was introduced as a new board member starting in July.

B. 1102 S. Main Ave.
Sherman Historic District
(Board action required)

Nathan Wieber, Homeowner

Nathan reviewed his request to demolish the existing single car garage for a new garage. The concrete slab of the existing garage is cracking

Member Halbach asked about materials. Nathan is proposing to use LP smart siding and with Jarrod Smart's input from the previous meeting, Nathan would like to use Marvin NexGen windows with a mullion pattern to compliment the house. Nathan stated that vinyl siding exists on the house with original wood siding underneath. Existing corbels on the house are wrapped with vinyl, with vinyl soffits. Historic images provided by the Siouxland Heritage Museum indicate the corbels were originally wood with an open design. The wood siding on the house indicated in the photos was 3"-4" wide.

Member Roti asked about the garage door and if two-single doors could be used in place of one double. To modify the width to accommodate two single doors would require increasing the garage by 3' to 4'. The homeowner said he would use a doublewide garage door that appears as two single, and not increase the square footage of the structure.

Member Cole asked what the square footage of the house is compared to the proposed garage and second story. The homeowner reported that the square footage of the two structures are approximately the same size. Member Cole asked about "like materials for like materials" as noted in the standards (for rehabilitation) and asked if the applicant would consider changing the siding to wood. Member Collins reminded the board that the LP smart siding is an acceptable replacement material for new construction.

Homeowner will investigate the dimension of the existing wood siding is under the vinyl, and match the new garage siding to that dimension. The historic photo shows a very narrow siding on the house. Nathan agreed that he would match the new garage to what was original on the house.

Member Sjovold asked how much taller the garage was going to be than the house. Diane noted that there are steps to the first floor of the house with a basement below, which increases the height of the house. Nathan responded that there are four steps from the sidewalk to the first floor.

Member Halbach noted that the style of the house is craftsman and that the band board on the existing house should be incorporated into the garage. Alex asked Nathan to consider adding open corbels that are also deeper to match the original corbels on the house. Members Sjovold and Halbach also suggested moving the banding above the garage doors to minimize the scale of the structure.

Diane noted that any modifications made to the design would have to be finalized based on the motion of the board. Nathan could continue working with 4D Design before coming back in for a building permit. If the design is different from what the board approves, Nathan will be required to come back to the board, for another review.

Member Roti reviewed the proposed modifications for another board member to include in a motion for approval.

Member Collins added that the clip gable on the front of the garage should also be used at the rear elevation.

Member Halbach made the motion that the proposed project would not have an adverse effect on the Sherman Historic District with the following modifications:

- Doublewide garage door should look like two single garages doors.
- Band board should be located above the garage doors.
- Reveal of the siding on the new garage should be comparable to the reveal of the siding on the house.
- Corbels on the garage should match the original corbels on the house.
- Remove the proposed shutters; and consider the window scale at the clipped gable. Member Remmers seconded the motion. Member Remmers asked what the bearing height of the trusses are for the garage and made a “friendly amendment” to the motion to drop them down if it improves the scale and height of the garage.

The remaining board members voted unanimously in favor of the motion with the noted modifications.

Adjournment

The Board of Historic Preservation meeting adjourned at approximately 5:15 p.m.